

San Francisco Bay Conservation and Development Commission

375 Beale Street, Suite 510, San Francisco, California 94105 tel 415 352 3600 fax 888 348 5190
State of California | Gavin Newsom – Governor | info@bcdc.ca.gov

July 10, 2020

TO: Environmental Justice Commissioner Working Group Members
FROM: Nahal Ghoghaie, Environmental Justice Program Manager (415/352-3648;
nahal.ghoghaie@bcdc.ca.gov)
SUBJECT: Draft Meeting Summary of May 7, 2020 Environmental Justice Commissioner Working Group Meeting

1. **Call to Order, Roll Call, Introductions and Approval of Agenda.** The meeting was called to order by Chair Ahn in a virtual meeting conducted via Zoom at 11:03 a.m.

Present were Group Members: Chair Eddie Ahn, Commissioner Sheri Pemberton, Commissioner Pat Showalter and Commissioner John Vasquez.

Not present was Group Member: Commissioner Jesse Arreguin.

BCDC Staff in attendance included, Environmental Justice Manager Nahal Ghoghaie, Planning Director Jessica Fain, Planning Manager Shannon Fiala, Enforcement Analyst Matthew Trujillo, Permit Analyst Morgan Chow, Shoreline Development Analyst Yuri Jewett, Permit Analyst Walt Deppe, Permit Analyst Morgan Chow, Waterfront Planner Katharine Pan, Coastal Planner Cody Aichele-Rothman and Bay Design Analyst Andrea Gaffney.

Also in attendance were: Daniela Cortes, Olivia Williams, Roman Berenshteyn, Stuart Drown, Robbie Powelson, and Emily Loper.

MOTION: Commissioner Vasquez moved approval of the Agenda, seconded by Commissioner Showalter. The agenda was approved by voice vote with no objections or abstentions.

2. **Approval of February 6, 2020 Environmental Justice Commissioner Working Group Meeting Minutes.**

MOTION: Commissioner Pemberton moved approval of the February 6, 2020 Meeting Minutes, seconded by Commissioner Vasquez. The motion was approved by voice vote with no objections or abstentions.

3. **Update on Environmental Justice and Social Equity (EJ/SE) Policy Implementation.** Ms. Ghoghaie presented the following:



Staff has developed several materials to assist staff and applicants with implementing the EJ/SE Policies. This includes a Guidance Document for Regulatory Staff, Policy FAQ for Applicants and a Community Vulnerability Mapping Tool. Staff has also begun working on apply the policies to specific projects, such as the Howard Terminal / Oakland A's project, and the Stockton Ship Channel Deepening project.

In the future staff would like to develop a CBO-Permit Applicant Matchmaking Database to help connect project applicants with community organizations through a map-based tool.

There are changes in Staff reports, including:

- Information on surrounding communities and existing environmental conditions relating to EJ
- Descriptions, outcomes, and analyses of meaningful community involvement
- Information on disproportionate project impacts
- Information on how community concerns are being addressed by applicant

Staff held two webinars on the new policies on February 25 and 27th, which were recorded and posted our website. The webinar was co-presented Nuestra Casa was very important component to hear directly from a community perspective. Staff has also presented to the Bay Planning Coalition. Through this outreach, we've reached at least 150 individuals so far. We are also planning internal staff trainings, and ongoing opportunities for Commissioners to learn about our work and provide input on program objectives.

Staff has been integrated EJ into its ongoing long-term planning efforts. *Bay Adapt: Regional Strategy for a Rising Bay* is a new BCDC-led regional planning effort. Ms. Ghoghaie has been helping forming an EJ Caucus including West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project, Greenaction, Nuestra Casa, Shore Up Marin City, Exploring ideas with the Exploratorium about outreach and education with Community-based organization. With the Seaport Plan update, developing an EJ and outreach strategy. Many Port communities are also EJ communities, so we are developing a tailored engagement process to be included in this amendment. Other planning efforts, such as the Susiun Marsh Project Plan, Climate Change Policy Guidance, Mitigation Bay Plan Amendment and ART processes will also be opportunities to implement the EJ policies.

Ms. Ghoghaie provided an update on the status of BCDC's Long Term EJ/SE Goals. With respect to improving meetings and materials accessibility, COVID and virtual meetings generally are making meetings more accessible to a wide audience. BCDC now has a social media presence on Facebook and Twitter. Utilizing those tools for information sharing and access.

- Language Access remains on our minds.
- Opportunity to update to Regulations on how we conduct mailings, public outreach, and how we distribute information to interested parties list. Staff are making sure equity is considered in these updates.

Integrating equity into BCDC's day-to-day activities. EJ Partner Coordination (NOAA, CCC, and SCC) – Group of EJ/ Equity coordinators at these agencies. Phone call check-ins to share resources and best practices. Ms. Ghoghaie described how BCDC is operationalizing Equity internally, primarily through the creation of a formal Racial Equity Team, which includes 12 staff including 2 senior staff. The purpose has been to develop a Racial Equity Action Plan for BCDC. The workplan includes summarizing equity working to date, assessing the baseline, learning from other agencies, conducting an agency-wide visioning process. We will invite participation from all staff and Commissioners.

4. Discussion on May 21, 2020 EJ Briefing for the Commission. Staff is planning to provide a full Commission deep dive briefing at the 5/21 Commission Meeting. Potential topics include: Describing outreach on EJ policies conducted to date; Demonstration of the Vulnerable Communities Web Tool; Discussion on ongoing and longer-term EJ and Equity Implementation; and Discussion of the BCDC Racial Equity Team effort.

Commissioner Showalter thanked Ms. Ghoghaie for this work. Can you describe the EJ Caucus and whether the Alviso Working Group is involved? The Water District had a stakeholder group that worked for about a decade. The Tech Museum in San Jose is very concerned about how to engage youth in vulnerable communities. Nahal will connect with Pat offline.

Commissioner Pemberton found the presentation very informative. It would be great for BCDC to have a briefing, especially the racial equity visioning and FAQ for applicants. The Leadership Council for Environmental Justice Advocacy submitted a letter about optimizing public participation during this time. Putting in a lot of thought about how to do this is extremely valuable. It would be great if SLC coordination calls with NOAA.

Morgan Chow asked about the briefing with permit staff.

Andrea Gaffney asked whether the presentation will be made available. Ms. Ghoghaie confirmed that it will be posted and shared electronically.

Commissioner Showalter agreed with Pemberton, and think going over the briefing to the Commission would be valuable. It would be helpful to have a summary such as a paragraph or two that Commissioners could post to their social media. Nahal will draft language and run it by Commissioner Showalter before sharing with Commissioners.

Katharine Pan asked Commissioners how to engage with Commissioners in the Racial Equity Plan development. She asked if this group would be willing to be a sounding board for that process. EJ Working Group members said this would be of interest to them.

Matthew Trujillo raised the point about language access. He encouraged this to be a higher priority than it currently is. He also asked about managing the both public-facing equity and internal equity team processes and how Ms. Ghoghaie is able to manage both at once.

Ms. Ghoghaie responded that language access is also a priority for her. Planning Director Jessica Fain clarified that funding is the primary barrier. BCDC can consider adding it to our regulations, but this is not a prerequisite to doing translation. Ms. Ghoghaie acknowledged the other staff who are providing leadership on internal racial equity work.

Commissioner Vasquez thanked staff. Since starting two years ago, the underlying premises that this group sought to answer have been addressed. He recommended giving the Commission with an overview presentation of the highlights that have come out of the Working Group, and deliver the rest in bits and pieces. As chair, Commissioner Ahn could start the briefing with comments on where we're at, and put it into Commissioner language.

Chair Ahn asked how many EJ groups are involved in this process.

Ms. Ghoghaie confirmed there are currently none formally involved in the EJ implementation process. Bay Adapt has taken priority, where BCDC has a small pot of funding to compensate CBOs for their participation. Working with four groups in EJ Caucus so far, and discussing how to expand this process.

Chair Ahn recommended compiling and reaching out to a broader list of EJ groups and organizations to make sure to attempt to include others. It's important to make the touch point to ensure EJ groups are at least aware of the policy updates. Chair wants to make sure the process is up front and inclusive.

Andrea Gaffney encouraged people to look at the Design Review Board staff reports. A recent (February 2020) staff report was the first-time staff made a concerted effort to incorporate the vulnerable communities and EJ policies into the staff report. The DRB is often the first public step of implementation in BCDC's permit review process. The report was very well-received by the DRB. BCDC is also starting a process to recruit new members to the DRB and there is a request to have someone come on board with more community-based experience.

Ms. Ghoghaie asked if there were any items that stood out as particularly critical for full Commission briefing.

Chair Ahn suggested trying to frame in term of relationships, sharing groups and community leaders that commissioners might be aware of, to help give credibility and credence to this process.

Commissioner Showalter agreed with Chair Ahn and recommended focusing on educational opportunities, not only for Commissioners but for people in their agencies.

5. Public Comment. Chair Ahn asked if there were any general public comments.

Robbie Powelson commented on impending evictions in Richardson Bay, in light of the environmental and structural racism present in southern Marin County. Targeting of the anchor outs has been necessitated by exclusionary housing practices and a variety of other social ills. Sausalito, for example, was issued one of the first school desegregation orders in 50 years. Belvedere is one of most inequitable cities in California. The anchor out community is very impoverished and isolated, and this has been missing from the discussion.

Chair Ahn thanked the speaker. Ms. Ghoghaie provided her contact information. Ms. Fain stated that staff will connect these discussions internally.

6. **Adjournment.** There being no further business, Chair Ahn adjourned the meeting at 12:05 p.m.