

SAN FRANCISCO BAY CONSERVATION AND DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION

50 California Street • Suite 2600 • San Francisco, California 94111 • (415) 352-3600 • Fax: (415) 352-3606 • www.bcdc.ca.gov

May 27, 2011

TO: All Design Review Board Members

FROM: Will Travis, Executive Director [415/352-3653 travis@bcdc.ca.gov]
Karen Weiss, Coastal Program Analyst [415/352-3669 karenw@bcdc.ca.gov]

SUBJECT: Treasure Island and Yerba Buena Island Redevelopment Project, City and County of San Francisco; Third Pre-Application Review
(For Board consideration on June 6, 2011)

Project Summary

Project Sponsors: Treasure Island Development Authority (TIDA); Treasure Island Community Development (TICD); and Treasure Island Enterprises (TIE)

Project Representatives Michael Tymoff, Deputy Director, Treasure Island Redevelopment Project (TIDA); Kevin Conger, Principal, CMG Landscape Architecture, on behalf of TICD; Dilip Trivedi, Principal, Moffatt and Nichol on behalf of TICD; Jay Wallace, on behalf of Treasure Island Enterprises.

Project Site. Treasure Island and Yerba Buena Island are located in the center of the San Francisco Bay within the City and County of San Francisco (Exhibit 1). The proposed Redevelopment Plan Area includes approximately 400 acres of land on Treasure Island, approximately 150 acres of land on Yerba Buena Island (YBI) and about 550 acres of tidal and submerged lands adjacent to the islands. The U.S. Navy is in the process of conveying most of these areas to the Treasure Island Development Authority (TIDA). The Bay surrounds the project site on all sides.

Treasure Island. From 1936 to 1939, the Works Progress Administration created Treasure Island (TI) for the 1939 Golden Gate International Exhibition using fill from the Bay and the Sacramento Delta. In 1941, the U.S. Navy took possession of the land and occupied the island for more than five decades. The former military base on TI covers approximately 450 acres. Currently, 900 residential units and approximately 91 buildings for non-residential uses cover approximately 65% of TI, yet only a portion of the residences and buildings are usable. The U.S. Department of Labor Job Corps occupies an approximately 36-acre site in the center of the island. The entire island has approximately 3.35 miles of shoreline, resulting in approximately 36-acres of land located within the Commission's 100-foot shoreline band (Exhibit 5).

The overall site is relatively flat with minimal native vegetation. Current ground elevations range from approximately six feet above sea level on the northwestern edge to approximately 14 feet above sea level near the southern edge.



Making San Francisco Bay Better

Yerba Buena Island. Private parties, the U.S. Army and the U.S. Navy have owned Yerba Buena Island since the 1840s. The U.S. Coast Guard currently operates an approximately 35-acre site on the southeast side of the island, and the California Department of Transportation (Caltrans) occupies an approximately 20-acre parcel that includes portions of the San Francisco-Oakland Bay Bridge and tunnel. On the island there are currently 100 residential units and 10 non-residential buildings within the Redevelopment Plan Area. Not all of the buildings are habitable.

Yerba Buena Island is a very steep island with valuable habitat and vegetation. The entire island ranges from sea level to approximately 340-feet above sea level at its peak. With over 1.8 miles of shoreline, approximately 21 acres are within the Commission's 100-foot shoreline band.

Proposed Project and Public Access/Transportation Amenities. The proposed redevelopment of Treasure Island and Yerba Buena Island includes: 6,000 to 8,000 residential units; 450,000 square feet of retail space; up to 500-hotel rooms and a cultural center; a new ferry terminal and transit program; approximately 300 acres of new public park and open space; and an approximately 3.5-mile-long public shoreline trail around TI and various trails on YBI. The proposed project would redevelop both Treasure Island and Yerba Buena Island over four phases spanning 10 to 15 years.

The project sponsors state that the goal of the proposed project is to create the most sustainable large development project in the United States. They have partnered with the Clinton Climate Change Initiative's Climate Positive Development Program, which supports the development of large-scale urban projects that demonstrate that cities can grow in ways that are "climate positive." In addition, they have agreed to implement economically viable Green innovations in buildings, utilize clean energy, and use green technology in waste, water and transportation management.

There are five primary components to the redevelopment of Treasure Island and Yerba Buena Island, including: (1) residential; (2) open space and recreation; (3) transportation; (4) commercial and adaptive reuse; and (5) community and public facilities.

Prior Board Review. The first pre-application review, in November 2009, provided a project overview to the Board, while the second pre-application review, in February 2010, focused on the seismic stabilization of Treasure Island and how the project and proposed public access would adapt to sea level rise.

In the first review of the project, the Board agreed that the project provided significant open space and requested more design details of the open space and public access, stating that the success of the open spaces would be determined by the details.

During the February 2010 review, the Board made the following comments: (1) the marina edge should be designed with consideration to the proposed uses and program at the marina; (2) bicycle connectivity between the project and the east span of the Bay Bridge is very important, and that the project should not offer "half a solution to bicycle access;" and (3) the project should provide an opportunity to create a more casual or "funky" waterfront character for the retail and commercial uses along the waterfront/marina edge.

Based on the Board's prior comments, the June 2011 design review will focus on the proposed transit hub and ferry terminal, the revised pedestrian and bicycle network on Yerba Buena Island, and the proposed marina expansion.

Transit Hub and Ferry Terminal. The primary mode of transportation for the proposed project is public transit. Through parking management, pricing and other policies, auto access would be discouraged and, therefore, a sustainable transportation system on Treasure Island and Yerba Buena Island would be essential. Located at the point of arrival from the Bay Bridge and the junction of the two islands, the intermodal Transit Hub would connect all regional, off-island transportation services such as buses and ferries with on-island services such as shuttles, bicycles and pedestrian access. Overall, the Transit Hub includes a new ferry quay, a ferry terminal, shelters for bus and shuttle transfers, and an area for ticket sales and travel and tourist information. Near the transportation hub would be facilities for East Bay and San Francisco bus service providers, shuttle service stops, bicycle parking, a pool of shared bicycles, a car share pod, and office space for the new Treasure Island Transportation Management Agency (TITMA).

Bus service to the island would be provided from the San Francisco Civic Center, the San Francisco Transbay Terminal and from the East Bay. Buses are proposed every five to 15 minutes. On the island, electric or alternative fuel shuttle-buses would be provided, and a fleet of bicycles would be available at the ferry terminal for visitors and residents to use.

Located at the southwest corner of TI, north of the causeway and west of Building One, the new ferry terminal would be within a 12-minute walk of 80% of the proposed residences. Implemented by the Water Emergency Transportation Authority (WETA), the ferry service would initially run at approximately 60-minute intervals. The goal would be to provide service to downtown San Francisco at 15-minute intervals at peak periods from 5am to 9pm.

The public access outside of the ferry terminal includes an approximately 30- to 70-foot-wide landscaped area with a portion of the Bay Trail along the entire shoreline area at the ferry terminal (Exhibit 10). In addition, the plaza in front of Building One would serve as a public access plaza and serve as the center of the island's transportation hub (Exhibit 7).

Adjacent to the public access area, the proposed passenger waiting area would have railings, weather screens, a canopy or roof structure, an information kiosk, ticket vending machines, a ticket collection area and seating. The ferry terminal building would include staff facilities, a storage room, and a maintenance area, such as a trash/recycling room and janitor's closet. The ferry terminal building would be built to provide views through the building out towards the ferries and downtown San Francisco (Exhibit 11).

Initially, the ferry terminal would include two side-loading ferry slips that would be designed to be replaced by bow-loading slips should demand increase in the future (Exhibits 8 and 9). The side-loading ferry terminals themselves include: a 13-foot-wide, 113-foot-long access pier with railing that may also have a canopy; an approximately 13-foot-wide, 90-foot-long, ADA-compliant gangway to connect to a float; an approximately 45-foot-wide, 115-foot-long concrete float that would be anchored by six to eight guide piles; and mooring dolphins and/or fender walls to protect the ferry from bumping against the slips and other structures (Exhibit 9). Under the bow-loading scenario, one slip would have a boarding float and gangway for side-loading

ferries, but passengers would reach the ferries via a 25- to 30-foot-wide, 110-foot-long transfer span, supported on piles at the shore end and hinged near the ferry (Exhibit 8).

To protect the ferry slips, the project proponents have proposed an approximately 200- to 300-foot-wide west-facing basin with angled breakwaters made of precast 18-inch-wide concrete sheet piles. Three breakwater variants were considered in the Environmental Impact Report, but the project sponsor's preferred alternative would be to initially construct an approximately 850-foot-long breakwater to the north, and a few years later, construct an approximately 350-foot-long breakwater to the south. Both breakwaters would have navigation lights to mark the harbor entrance. Due to high waves overtopping the northern breakwater, no public access along the breakwater is proposed. If built, the south breakwater would likely provide a 12-foot-wide public access path.

In order to create a navigable basin, the project proponents are proposing to dredge approximately 32,000 cubic yards over an approximately 227,000 square foot (4.9 acre) area to a depth of about 16 feet (plus 2 feet of over-depth allowance).

The ferries themselves would hold approximately 149 to 699 passengers, and be approximately 200 feet long and 55 feet wide with a draft of up to eight feet. Up to two vessels could overnight at the ferry terminal, and routine operations, such as sewage pump-out, filling potable water storage containers, and light maintenance would occur at the terminal.

The project proponents are proposing approximately 0.94 acres (40,946 square feet) of fill for the ferry, including approximately 0.73 acres of solid fill, 0.01 acres pile-supported fill, and 0.2 acres of floating fill. In addition, in the Bay, they are proposing to fill approximately 1.12 acres with riprap for shoreline protection within the ferry basin. Therefore, the ferry terminal project as proposed includes approximately 2.06 acres of fill.

Yerba Buena Island Access. The proposed development on Yerba Buena Island (YBI) is primarily restricted to areas with pre-existing development. Serving as a destination and an integral link to provide regional access, the project proponents have redesigned the public access on YBI based on comments from the BCDC staff, the San Francisco Bay Trail Project, the San Francisco Bicycle Coalition, the East Bay Bicycle Coalition and the San Francisco Department of Public Health. The proposal includes reconfiguring MacCalla Road into a one-way road with both a Class I and Class II bicycle lane, providing a two-way road on Treasure Island Road and providing a two-way road at MacCalla and Hill Crest Roads.

Exiting Treasure Island towards YBI, a 10-foot-wide Class I bicycle and pedestrian lane would be provided on both sides of the causeway; 500-feet south of the MacCalla Road intersection a scenic overlook for pedestrians and bicyclist would be provided with interpretive signage and a bench (Exhibit 16). Continuing up the hill on Treasure Island road, a Class II and partially Class III bicycle lane would be built utilizing the existing roadway and viaduct (Exhibits 17, 18, and 19), which would continue as a Class II trail on Hillcrest Road to connect the south side of the island to access on the Bay Bridge (Exhibit 20 and 21).

The primary bicycle and pedestrian lanes would be provided on MacCalla Road, including: a 16-foot-wide Class I mixed-use bicycle and pedestrian path in both directions separated by a curb and gutter; an 11-foot-wide one-way vehicular lane; a 2- to 3-foot-wide buffer; and a 6- to 7-foot-wide downhill Class II lane for more advanced bicyclist (Exhibit 22). At the top of

MacCalla Road, the Class I bicycle and pedestrian lane would connect to the Class I trail proposed by Caltrans, which would then connect to South Gate Drive and the public access path on the East Span of the Bay Bridge (Exhibit 23).

Additional access on YBI includes: (1) a hilltop park with picnic tables, view overlooks, open lawn areas and recreational amenities (Exhibit 24); (2) a beach park near Clipper Cove with access from an approximately 8-space parking lot and Treasure Island Road (Exhibit 25); and (3) the Senior Officer's Quarters Historic District including the "Great Whites," landscaping, gardens, picnic areas and interpretative signs.

The Marina. The marina proposed by Treasure Island Enterprise is located in Clipper Cove between Treasure Island and YBI. The project as proposed would remove the entire existing marina, including 107 slips with 99 wooden piles and three floating docks totaling 2,660 cubic yards of fill over approximately 44,400 square feet (Exhibit 26). Once remedial action is taken at Site 27 by the U.S. Navy, the proposed project includes maintenance dredging of up to 200,000 cubic yards of fill to a basin depth of -12 feet MLLW (Exhibit 27) and installing eight new docks and approximately 398 new ADA accessible boat slips. The proposed project includes an approximately 8-foot-wide, 820-foot-long publicly accessible transit dock/wave attenuation system at the southeast entrance of the marina. The project would also include approximately 2,060 cubic yards of solid fill over an approximately 930-square-foot area for approximately 385 new pier pilings, and approximately 11,440 cubic yards of floating fill over approximately 155,120 square feet for eight new docks and 398 new boat slips (Exhibit 28). The majority of the new docks would be eight feet wide, and range in length from 450 feet to 1,140 feet. The piles would be installed by vibratory or impact hammer, and no more than 40 slips or approximately 10% of the marina would be for live-aboards. The proposed marina would include a net increase of fill of approximately 8,780 cubic yards over 2.5 acres (110,694 square feet).

Upland improvements include parking, restrooms, showers, laundry, and a maintenance and service yard along the Clipper Cove Promenade. Since Treasure Island Enterprises does not control the planning or decision making for any of the upland areas adjacent to the marina, the exact location of the upland improvements have not yet been identified. Most likely the facilities would be located in the mixed-use buildings across the street from proposed promenade and the marina (Exhibit 29 and 30).

San Francisco Bay Plan Policies. The *San Francisco Bay Plan* (Bay Plan) **Public Access** policies state that access should "be provided in and through every new development in the Bay or on the shoreline," be designed—using the Commission's *Public Access Design Guidelines*—"to encourage diverse Bay-related activities and movement to and along the shoreline," be conveniently located near parking and public transit, "permit barrier free access for the physically handicapped...and include an ongoing maintenance program." These policies state in part that "public access should be sited, designed and managed to prevent significant adverse effects on wildlife," and that, "whenever public access to the Bay is provided as a condition of development, on fill or in the shoreline, the access should be permanently guaranteed." Lastly, **Bay Plan Map** No. 4 identifies Yerba Buena Island as a site for waterfront beach/park priority use.

The Bay Plan **Recreation** policies state that "[f]ill should be permitted for marina facilities that must be in or over the Bay, such as breakwaters, shoreline protection, boat berths, ramps, launching facilities, pumpout and fuel docks, and short-term unloading areas;" further,

“marinas should include public amenities, such as viewing areas, restrooms, public mooring docks or floats and moorages for transient recreational boaters, non-motorized small boat launching facilities, public parking; substantial physical and visual access; and maintenance for all facilities.”

Public Access Issues. The staff believes that the ferry terminal project, the public access on YBI, and the proposed marina design raise a number of issues for the Design Review Board (Board) to address in its review. At this conceptual stage, the applicant and staff are seeking the Board’s input and advice on the general concept of the proposed ferry terminal, YBI access, and marina. More specifically the Board’s advice is sought on: whether the proposed project provides adequate, usable and attractive public access spaces, and whether the project maintains or enhances visual quality.

1. **Does the proposed project provide adequate, usable, and attractive public access spaces?** In addition to the Bay Plan Public Access policies, the *Public Access Design Guidelines* (Guidelines) state that public access spaces should be “designed and built to encourage diverse, Bay-related activities along the shoreline”, to create a “sense of place”, and be “designed for a wide range of users.” The Guidelines also state that, “access areas are utilized most if they provide direct connections to public rights-of-way such as streets and sidewalks...” The Guidelines further state that this may be accomplished by “incorporating the designated Bay Trail route into shoreline projects and providing clear and continuous transitions to adjacent developments,” and that the public access areas should take “advantage of existing site characteristics and opportunities.”

The Board should advise the staff, the Commission and the project sponsors whether the conceptual ideas and goals of the ferry terminal, the revised bicycle and pedestrian access on YBI, and the marina public access and open space areas are sufficient to accommodate the expected level of use and variety of users, are designed to take advantage of existing site characteristics and opportunities, facilitate access in and through the developed areas, and are conveniently located near transit and parking facilities.

2. **Does the proposed project maintain and enhance the visual quality of the Bay, shoreline and adjacent developments?** In addition to the Bay Plan policies on Appearance, Design and Scenic Views, the Design Guidelines state that —the design character of public access areas should relate to the scale and intensity of the proposed development. In order to achieve this objective, the Guidelines suggest that —[v]iew opportunities, shoreline configuration and access points are factors that determine a site’s inherent public access opportunities,” and to maintain and enhance the visual quality projects should “utilize the shoreline for Bay-related land uses as much as possible....”

The Board should advise the Commission and the project proponents on whether the proposed project design complements and enhances public views of the Bay from the shoreline and through the project site, especially along the waterfront near the ferry terminal towards San Francisco, at the marina, and along the bicycle and pedestrian access on YBI.