

Save Clipper Cove

1455 Alabama Street
San Francisco, CA 94110
www.saveclippercove.org

January 11, 2017

R. Zachary Wasserman, Chair
Bay Conservation and Development Commission
455 Golden Gate Avenue, Suite 10600
San Francisco, CA 94102-7019
via email: brad.mccrea@bcdc.ca.gov

Dear Mr. Wasserman:

I write on behalf of Save Clipper Cove to encourage the Bay Conservation and Development Commission to reject the recent marina expansion proposal unveiled by Treasure Island Enterprises at the November 16, 2016, board meeting of the Treasure Island Development Authority (TIDA).

As proposed, the marina expansion would dramatically reshape the most valuable venue for small boating in the San Francisco Bay. Much would be lost in this redevelopment, yet comparatively little gained. The proposed expansion would have a dramatic net negative impact on public education and public recreation on the San Francisco Bay. Worse, the proposed expansion would fill-in the Bay far more than necessary to provide additional marina berthing in the Central Bay.

The proposed expansion has been met by widespread public opposition. Attached are letters from the Sierra Club, Friends of the Sailing Center, Treasure Isle Marina Tenants for Balanced Expansion, and Raft Up Community for Clipper Cove, each detailing dramatic negative impacts that would be imposed by current marina expansion proposal for each of their communities.

Under this proposal, the marina would expand from covering 7% of the Cove to covering 31% of the Cove, an expansion of 342%, permanently eliminating public access to one third of the Cove. Anchorage in the Cove would be significantly reduced. Sailing area for dinghies and small boats would be dramatically reduced, a major sacrifice given that the Cove is widely considered one of the premier small boating venues on the West Coast. Marina berthing for boats under 40' would be eliminated entirely.

The proposal would significantly restrict and reduce the range and depth of the programs operated by the Treasure Island Sailing Center, particularly its youth sailing and education programs, affecting thousands of users each year. These impacts have been documented in detail by the Treasure Island Sailing Center and recently validated by Friends of the Sailing Center. This change would significantly reduce public recreation on the Bay as well as public education about the Bay.

The dramatic reduction in small boating on Clipper Cove would violate the development objective set out under the San Francisco Bay plan to expand small boating in Clipper Cove. Besides the loss of boating under TISC programs, high school and collegiate training and racing would also be diminished. In addition, the Laser and V15 adult sailing fleets that practice and race in Clipper Cove would be negatively impacted.

The proposed marina expansion would significantly reduce the area of the Cove available for recreational anchoring – an increasingly popular public recreation in the Cove. Recent anchor-out events in Clipper Cove have attracted scores of boats.

The TIE proposal would also significantly reduce the opportunity for public recreation on the San Francisco Bay by eliminating nearly 100 marina berths for small and medium sized boats in the Central Bay. The redeveloped marina would eliminate all marina berthing in Clipper Cove for boats smaller than 40 feet. As a result, the Central Bay would lose 97 slips run from 16 feet to 36 feet. The marina, which is currently dedicated almost entirely to boats under 40 feet, is currently fully occupied and maintains a very long wait list.

In exchange for this dramatic reduction in public education and public recreation on the San Francisco Bay, TIE proposes a marina expansion to provide berthing for an additional 229 boats as well as a long guest dock. While marina expansion in Clipper Cove is called for under the San Francisco Bay plan, this particular proposal produces a trade-off that results in a dramatic net reduction in public education and public recreation on the San Francisco Bay. Worse, TIE proposes an extremely inefficient marina design that fills in the Bay far more than is necessary to provide such berthing.

Overall the average slip length across all 336 slips in the new marina would be 54 feet, 18 feet longer than the average slip length at San Francisco's South Beach marina (36 feet) and 23 feet longer than the average slip length in the current Clipper Cove marina (31 feet). This dedication to extremely large boats not only increases the length and width of the slips but also necessitates extra wide fairways, significantly expanding the marina's footprint.

In addition, the new plan proposes providing two finger slip docks per boat, pushing the marina's footprint further southward, putting pressure on youth and beginning sailors trying to pass through a choke point entrance into the Cove and eliminating valuable anchor-out space. In comparison South Beach Marina provides only one finger slip dock per boat.

The Treasure Island Sailing Center recently proposed a much more efficient marina design that provides the same number of berths as the current proposal but does so with a significantly smaller footprint - 25% smaller. This alternate design provides for boats that average 45 feet in length (still far larger than the 36 foot average at South Beach) and provides only one finger slip per boat (parallel to South Beach). This

alternative would be much better aligned with the objectives of the San Francisco Bay plan.

The Sailing Center has also identified the maximum marina expansion that could be implemented with minimal impact on public recreation and education on the Bay. It is this alternative that would provide the greatest net increase in public recreation and education on the San Francisco Bay. The Sailing Center's minimum impact option would permit doubling the number of slips in the marina while increasing the average slip size from 31' to 42'.

The Sailing Center has conducted a detailed financial analysis documenting the financial viability of more efficient marina designs such as the above.

[See: <https://tisailing.org/images/2015/TIDevelopment/tisc-marinafeasibilityanalysis-161019.pdf>]

The latest proposal forwarded by Treasure Island Enterprises would dramatically reduce public recreation and public education on the Bay, particular small boating in Clipper Cove. Worse, the proposed expansion would fill-in the Bay far more than necessary to provide additional marina berthing in the Central Bay.

This new proposal should be rejected.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Hunter Cutting', with a long horizontal line extending to the right.

Hunter Cutting

Friends of the Sailing Center

3150 – 18th Street, MB #309
San Francisco, CA 94110

December 20, 2016

Mr. Brad McCrea
Bay Conservation and Development Commission
455 Golden Gate Avenue, Suite 10600
San Francisco, CA 94102-7019
brad.mccrea@bcdc.ca.gov

Dear Mr. McCrea:

We write as supporters of the Treasure Island Sailing Center (TISC) at Clipper Cove. We are former TISC board members, former executive directors, former program directors, former sailing instructors, former volunteer program chairs as well as program participants, tenants, and parents at TISC. In this capacity we bring years of experience regarding the value of Clipper Cove and in particular deep knowledge regarding the public access programs of TISC.

Please know that the recent marina proposal unveiled by Treasure Island Enterprises at the November 16, 2016, board meeting of the Treasure Island Development Authority (TIDA) would significantly reduce the range and depth of the programs operated by TISC, particularly its youth programs.

While we applaud the spirit of TISC in offering this sacrifice in order to preserve at least part of the Cove for public use, we believe this proposal does not meet the public interest.

Under this proposal, the marina would expand from covering 7% of the Cove to covering 31% of the Cove, an expansion of 342%, permanently eliminating public access to 1/3 of the Cove. In addition, the configuration of the marina footprint would leave only a narrow and challenging entrance to the Cove. Public recreation and access to the San Francisco Bay will be significantly reduced, particular for small boaters and youth.

There would be a 24% reduction in the sailing area used each year by more than 2,000 4th graders from San Francisco public schools participating in the STEM (science, technology, engineering, and mathematics) curriculum classes operated by TISC on the San Francisco Bay.

The configuration of the proposed marina would entirely block some beginning and youth sailors at TISC from entering the Cove, preventing them from accessing the heart of the cove as well as the beach.

High school and collegiate racing will be pushed part way out of the Cove, mandating the expense of additional safety boats as well as prompting additional racing limitations and cancellations when conditions outside the Cove become dangerous.

These findings have been documented by TISC in a detailed assessment of the new marina proposal. TISC [documented](#) in considerable detail how this proposal would significantly decrease the range and depth of TISC programs, in particular the dramatic loss of access for youth sailors, at both the beginning and high school levels, as well as the loss of educational opportunity for SFUSD students engaged in STEM curriculum on the San Francisco Bay. See pages 7 and 8 of TISC [report](#) detailing these impacts. [See: https://tisailing.org/images/2015/TIDevelopment/sharedapproachoverview_redacted.compressed.pdf]

In exchange for this reduction in public use, TIE proposes an extremely inefficient marina design that unnecessarily fills in the Bay such that 1/3 of the Cove is lost. In exchange for this loss of open water on the Bay, TIE's proposed marina expansion would provide berthing for an additional 229 boats and a long guest dock. However, the length of the average slip for these additional 229 boats would be 57 feet – 21 feet longer than the average slip length at San Francisco's South Beach marina (36 feet). Overall the average slip length across the entire new marina would be 54 feet – compared to 31 feet currently. This dedication to extremely long boats not only increases the length and width of the slips but also necessitates extra wide fairways. Moreover the new plan proposes providing two finger slip docks per boat, causing the marina to expand further southward, putting additional pressure on youth and beginning sailors trying to pass through a choke point entrance into the Cove. In comparison South Beach Marina provides only one finger slip dock per boat.

As an example of a detailed plan better aligned with the public interest and BCDC's San Francisco Bay Plan, TISC recently proposed a much more efficient marina design that provides the same number of berths as the current proposal but does so with a significantly smaller footprint - 25% smaller. This alternate design provided for boats that averaged 45 feet in length (still far larger than the 36 foot average at South Beach) and provided only one finger slip per boat (parallel to South Beach).

TISC's study also identified the maximum marina expansion that could be implemented with minimal impact on current public use of the Bay. That expansion would more than double the number of slips in the marina and increase the average slip size from 31 feet to 42 feet. It is this alternative that would provide the greatest net increase in public recreation and education on the San Francisco Bay.

TISC also conducted a detailed financial analysis that [documents](#) the financial viability of more efficient marina designs such as the above. [See: <https://tisailing.org/images/2015/TIDevelopment/tisc-marinafeasibilityanalysis-161019.pdf>]

In sum, the latest proposal forwarded by Treasure Island Enterprises would significantly reduce the opportunity for public recreation and public education on the Bay. Overall public access and activity on the Bay would be reduced, particular small boating in Clipper Cove. At the same time, the proposal would fill in the Bay far more than necessary to provide additional marina berthing in the Central Bay.

This new proposal could and should be improved upon.

Thank you for your attention here.

Sincerely,

Bob Tennant	Former TISC Board Member
Marcella Churchill	Former TISC Board Member
Jack McDonald	Former TISC Board Member
Jay Palace	Former TISC Board Member
Michelle Tennant	Former TISC Executive Director
Robbie Dean	Former TISC Executive Director
Avery Whitmarsh	Former Co-chair of TISC Adaptive Sailing Program/Former Vanguard 15 Fleet Captain
Kevin Berry	Former TISC Managing Director
Annie Butts	Former TISC Program Coordinator and Head Instructor
Chris Childers	Former TISC Program Director and Head Instructor
Anthony Poles	Former TISC Sailing Instructor
Laura Breen	Former TISC Sailing Instructor
Ruth Breen	Former TISC Sailing Instructor
Kevin Bilcoe	Former TISC Sailing Instructor
Cazzie Cutting	High School Sailing Coach - Golden Gate Yacht Club/Former TISC Student
Thomas Rohr	TISC parent
Hunter Cutting	TISC parent
Paul Heineken	Volunteer Cal Varsity Sailing Coach
Rich Jepsen	Board of Directors, U.S. Sailing
Dan Altreuter	TISC Tenant/Current Vanguard 15 Team Racing Co-Chair
David Byron	TISC Tenant
Sally Madsen	TISC Tenant/Former Vanguard 15 Fleet Captain and Volunteer Chair/Former Captain of the Stanford Sailing Team

Tim Murphy	TISC Tenant
Claire Pratt	TISC Tenant/Former Vanguard 15 Thursday Night Racing Chair and Volunteer Chair/Former Captain of the University of Washington Sailing Team
Kevin Richards	TISC Tenant
Adam Rothschild	TISC Tenant/Former Vanguard 15 Thursday Night Racing Chair
Krysia Pohl	Former TISC Tenant
Nick Adamson	Former TISC Tenant/1996 US Olympian Laser Class
Mark Adams	Former TISC Tenant
Brian Haines	Former TISC Tenant
Ryan Cox	Former TISC Tenant
Ted Conrads	Former TISC Tenant
Holt Condon	Former TISC Tenant
Harrison Turner	Former TISC Tenant
Mike Martin	505 World Champion
Andy Zinn	Former Captain of the Cal Sailing Team
Bruce Edwards	Former Executive Vice President of West Marine
Mike Holt	505 World Champion
Steve Bourdow	Former Stanford Sailing Team Head Coach/1992 US Olympian, Silver Medalist
Rob Woelfel	505 World Champion
Blaine Pedlow	Former Captain of the Cal Sailing Team
Mike Mahoney	
Eric Vanolst	
Courtney Clamp	
Douglas Dommermuth	
Jago Macleod	
Laura Macleod	
Ryan Nelson	
Eric Anderson	
Ian O'Leary	
Rich Mundell	
Segah Meer	
Rob Waterman	
Aaron Ross	
Pat Diola	
Jeff Miller	
Zhenya Kirueshkin-Stepanoff	
Ian Connors	
Geoff Gales	
Justin Shaffer	
Eben Russell	
Reeve Dunne	



San Francisco Group of the San Francisco Bay Chapter

Reply to:
Sierra Club, San Francisco Group
1474 Sacramento St., #305
San Francisco, CA 94109

January 3, 2017

Mr. Brad McCrea
Bay Conservation and Development Commission
455 Golden Gate Avenue, Suite 10600
San Francisco, CA 94102-7019
brad.mccrea@bcdc.ca.gov

Dear Mr. McCrea:

We write on behalf of the Sierra Club regarding the proposed development of Clipper Cove and in particular the recent marina expansion proposal introduced by Treasure Island Enterprises at the November 16, 2016, board meeting of the Treasure Island Development Authority (TIDA).

The Club has considered the November proposal and found that the scale of the marina as currently proposed is much greater than can be accommodated without significant negative impacts on public recreation on the San Francisco Bay. The Club is also concerned about the potential impact on views of open water, potential restriction of space for anchor-outs and detrimental impact on the eelgrass beds near the shore of Yerba Buena Island.

The Treasure Island Sailing Center developed two alternate scenarios to illustrate different options for development of a marina in Clipper Cove. The San Francisco Group of the Sierra Club has reviewed these scenarios as well as the developers' proposals. The Group has endorsed the Sailing Center's minimum impact option (see attached) as the best option presented for development of a marina in Clipper Cove. The minimal impact option is designed to allow for a doubling of the number of berths in the marina, and an increase in the average berth length from 31' to 42'. While this expansion is dramatic, the impact on current use of the cove would be minimized.

We urge your consideration of the minimal impact scenario.

Sincerely,

Becky Evans
Vice-Chair, San Francisco Group

Hunter Cutting
San Francisco Group

CC: Jane Kim Jane.Kim@sfgov.org; Aaron Peskin Aaron.Peskin@sfgov.org

Raft Up Community For Clipper Cove

1843 Chestnut St, Oakland, CA

January 3, 2017

Mr. Brad McCrea
Bay Conservation and Development Commission
455 Golden Gate Avenue, Suite 10600
San Francisco, CA 94102-7019
brad.mccrea@bcdc.ca.gov

Dear Mr. McCrea:

We write this letter to you today as Bay boaters and as members of the anchor out community in Clipper Cove, in a plea to save some of it for us.

We've found our best friends out at Clipper Cove, we've learned to sail out at Clipper Cove, and we've put together a community of friends that has brought incredible art and technology into the Bay area. Many friends who had never sailed or spent time on the water immediately went shopping for boats and then learning to sail after attending their first raft up. We've performed four marriages inside our circle of boats out at raft-ups at Clipper Cove. The raft ups are a magical introduction to the maritime lifestyle.

Clipper Cove is one the most valuable anchoring locations, if not the most valuable location, across the entire Central Bay, making it an irreplaceable resource for recreation on the Bay. The geography of the Cove is such that it is extremely well protected from wind, chop, swell, and current – all key elements for good anchorage. Moreover, Clipper Cove is centrally located and easily accessible by land and water, and provides stunning vistas.

However, the recent marina proposal unveiled by Treasure Island Enterprises (TIE) at the last November board meeting of the Treasure Island Development Authority (TIDA) will significantly reduce public recreation on the San Francisco Bay by dramatically reducing open water for anchoring out in Clipper Cove.

Under this proposal, the marina would expand from 7% of the Cove to 31% of the Cove, an expansion of 342%, permanently eliminating public access to 1/3rd of the Cove. In particular, the area available for anchoring out in the Cove will be significantly reduced as the southern boundary of the proposed marina will cut in the heart of the area used for anchoring out in Clipper Cove.

Worse, TIE proposes an extremely inefficient marina design that unnecessarily fills in the Bay. The Treasure Island Sailing Center recently

proposed a much more efficient marina design that provides the same number of berths as the current proposal but does so with a footprint that is 25% smaller. This alternative is better aligned with the public interest and the San Francisco Bay Plan. The Sailing Center also identified the maximum marina expansion that could be implemented with minimal impact on current public use of the Bay, including minimal impact on anchoring. This minimum expansion would more than double the number of slips in the marina and increase the average slip size from 31' to 42'. This minimum alternative would provide the greatest net increase in public recreation and education on the San Francisco Bay. The Sailing Center conducted a detailed financial analysis that documents the financial viability of more efficient marina designs such as the above.

For documentation of the Center analysis please see:

http://tisailing.org/images/2015/TIDevelopment/sharedapproachoverview_redact.compressed.pdf

<https://tisailing.org/images/2015/TIDevelopment/tisc-marinafeasibilityanalysis-161019.pdf>

The TIE proposal would significantly reduce the opportunity for public recreation on the San Francisco Bay by reducing the open water available for anchoring out in Clipper Cove. However, smaller, more efficient, and viable marina alternatives have been identified and detailed.

We encourage you uphold the public interest and policies of the San Francisco Bay Plan and reject the TIE proposal. We also cordially invite you to join us for dinner at the next raftup.

Sincerely,

Sunny Allen, Her Majesty - Hunter 33

Adam Katz, Kiki - Ericson 35

Shanee Stopnitsky, Galaxea - Freedom 29

Sean Faul, Temptress - Pearson Alberg 35

Jonathan Leidlein, His Highness - Avon 9

Jennifer Kopp, Sababa - Baba 30

Jason Dorsett, Bitcoin Swoosh - Bayliner 19
Brian Schrier, Triple Helix - Tristar Trimaran 45

Kevin Fischer

Eva Stevens & Tommaso Boggia, Magnolia - Hunter Legend 35'

C. Alaric Moore, Rendezvous - Cal III 34'

Michael J. Pesavento, Ph.D - data scientist at 3Scan

Taran Smith, Wanderer - Cal 31

Peter McAvoy, Spanish Flea - Alberg 30

Tom Bishop - software engineer at Apple

Colleen McKenzie - software engineer at Google

Sean Kennedy - Business Owner and Human Interface Specialist

Siri Oaklander - Sr. Product Manager at Splunk Inc.

Jen Zariat

Victoria Skelly - Sr. Designer at Wind River Systems (An Intel Company)

Avi Goldberg, Zephyr - Columbia 36

Elisha Hoyt, Schwester - Cal 25

Serenity Wang

Dustin Dettmer, Valella - Ericson 35

Christopher Rasch - CEO at Wishforge, Inc.

Bashir Fouad Ziady, Barge

Aeron Tynes Hammack, Ph.D - COO at EpiBiome, Inc.

Lyra Levin, Mechwarrior Princess at Megabots

Nick Anderson, Waitakere - Catalina 400 40

Antony Garrett Lisi - Director at Pacific Science Institute

Treasure Island Marina Tenants For Balanced Expansion

1530 Fulton Street, San Francisco, CA 94117

January 2, 2017

Mr. Brad McCrea
Bay Conservation and Development Commission
455 Golden Gate Avenue, Suite #10600
San Francisco, CA 94102-7019
brad.mccrea@bcdc.ca.gov

Dear Mr. McCrea:

We write as current tenants of the Treasure Island Marina in Clipper Cove.

Please know that the recent marina expansion proposal presented by Treasure Island Enterprises (TIE) to the Treasure Island Development Authority (TIDA) at TIDA's November meeting will effectively eliminate marina berthing for small and medium sized boats in Clipper Cove, dramatically reducing the opportunity for public recreation in the Central Bay.

- The marina proposal unveiled by TIE would eliminate all marina berthing in Clipper Cove for boats smaller than 40 feet. The current marina affords 107 slips overall. 97 of these slips run from 16 feet to 36 feet. The average slip length in current marina is 31 feet. The marina is currently fully occupied and maintains a very long wait list.
- Under TIE's proposal, no slip smaller than 40 feet will be available, and only seven 40-foot slips will be available. Overall, TIE's proposal would provide 336 slips ranging from 40 feet to 80 feet. The average slip length under the new proposal would be 54'.

Documents submitted by the marina developers to the State Division of Boating and Waterways explicitly declare that existing slip holders will be charged their current rates only as long as their current slips exist, and that all holders of new slips will be charged at new rates, i.e. there will be no grandfathering to protect recreation with small and medium boats. A May staff report by the State Division of Boating and Waterways specifies that the monthly rental rate for the 45 ft. slips will be \$16/ft. for a total monthly fee of \$720.

A detailed marina plan consistent with the public interest and the BCDC San Francisco Bay Plan was recently produced by the Treasure Sailing Center. The Center's plan proposes a much more efficient marina design that provides the same number of berths as the current proposal but does so with a significantly smaller footprint - 25% smaller. This alternate design provides for boats that average 45 feet in length, as opposed to the 54 ft. average in the current proposal. The Sailing Center also identified the maximum expansion that could be implemented with minimal impact on current public use of the Bay. This minimum expansion would still more than double the number of slips in the marina and increase the average slip size from 31' to 42'. The Sailing Center conducted a detailed financial analysis that documents the financial viability of more efficient marina designs such as the above.

The TIE proposal would significantly reduce the opportunity for public recreation on the San Francisco Bay by eliminating nearly 100 marina berths for small and medium sized boats in the Central Bay.

Please uphold recreation on San Francisco Bay for boaters with small and medium vessels, and reject the TIE proposal.

Sincerely,

Larry Doyle

TI Marina Berth B-11, Naima - Catalina 27, Slip holder since 1998

Lt. Dwayne Newton, SFFD, Ret.

TI Berth B-17, GAIA - 27' International Folkboat – Slip holder since 1993

Bruce Fauss

TI Berth C-5, Catalina 27

Aidan Doyle, former TISC instructor

TI Marina Berth B-11, Catalina 27 Naima