

San Francisco Bay Conservation and Development Commission

455 Golden Gate Avenue, Suite 10600, San Francisco, California 94102 tel 415 352 3600 fax 415 352 3606

April 15, 2016

TO: All Commissioners and Alternates

FROM: Lawrence J. Goldzband, Executive Director (415/352-3653; larry.goldzband@bcdc.ca.gov)

Sharon Louie, Director, Administrative & Technology Services (415/352-3638; sharon.louie@bcdc.ca.gov)

SUBJECT: Draft Minutes of April 7, 2016 Commission Meeting

1. Call to Order. The meeting was called to order by Acting Chair Halsted, at the MetroCenter Auditorium, 101 Eighth Street, Oakland, California at 1:22 p.m.

2. Roll Call. Present were: Chair Wasserman (arrived at 1:24 p.m.), Vice Chair Halsted and Commissioners Addiego, Bates, Chan (represented by Alternate Gilmore), Gioia, Gorin, McGrath, Nelson, Pine, Randolph, Sartipi (represented by Alternate McElhinney), Techel, Wagenknecht, Ziegler and Zwissler.

Ms. Louie announced that a quorum was present.

Not present were Commissioners: Santa Clara County (Cortese), Secretary for Resources (DeLaRosa), Department of Finance (Finn), Speaker of the Assembly (Gibbs), U.S. Army Corps of Engineers (Hicks), City and County of San Francisco (Kim), State Lands Commission (Lucchesi), Marin County (Sears), Solano County (Spering).

3. Public Comment Period. Acting Chair Halsted called for public comment on subjects that were not on the agenda.

There were two public speakers present to comment.

Martin Gruber addressed the Commission: I am a resident of Vallejo, California and I am here to address the Orcem/VMT Project that is proposed for Vallejo and specifically how it deals with the question of sea level rise and the related questions of tsunamis and flooding which evidently are relevant today.

In a letter from this Commission, dated November 2nd, 2015 you did say that their climate change plans appear to be inadequate. There are some additional considerations that I am hoping you will be able to review.

One is that their flooding estimate was kept under 10 feet. Ten feet is the lowest point of the land in this project and their flood estimation only looks at impacts on the terminal not on potential land facilities. In order to do this they postulate that there is no wind at time of flooding. That gives them a maximum flood estimate of 9.45 feet. 9.5 of course, would have been rounded up to 10 and that would have required an evaluation of land flooding.

info@bcdc.ca.gov | www.bcdc.ca.gov
State of California | Edmund G. Brown, Jr. — Governor



BCDC MINUTES
April 7, 2016

The slope of the land towards the water is between one and five degrees. If it penetrates at all it has the potential to go quite far in. There is a 45-foot high, outdoor pile of slag projected for this project. Even at that, in order to reach these low flood estimates they had to use the moderate not the severe projections of sea level rise. The worst one would have definitely increased the flood impact on water and land.

They also took the figures for San Francisco when there are figures that were derived for Solano County. The figures for Solano County are higher. This project is located in Solano County.

They did this to keep the flood estimate lower. I hope you will be able to look at that.

They also disregarded the question of tsunami preparedness by saying that the maximum tsunami level projected is less than the maximum 100-year flood projected.

One problem with this is that tsunamis have a great deal of force which flooding does not. There is a great deal of water horizontally that comes in behind a tsunami and it can be moving at over 600 miles per hour. They have to look at the question if it can survive the force of the tsunami as well as the height.

I am available if anyone has any questions.

Jack Fischetti of the Bay Planning Coalition was recognized by Chair Wasserman: We have an event coming up May 6th. It is our 2016 Spring Summit formerly known as the Decision Makers Conference or the DMC. It is going to be held at the Oakland Scottish Rite Center. It is an all day event. The theme is Bay Planning for the Next 33 Years, Risks, Readiness and Rewards.

We are going to feature three conversation-style panels with experts in industry, infrastructure and shoreline waterfronts. They are going to be discussing the future of the Bay Area in light of sea level rise. For more information you can talk to me or go to our website at bayplanningcoalition.org.

Chair Wasserman moved to Approval of the Minutes.

4. Approval of Minutes of the March 17, 2016 Meeting. Chair Wasserman asked for a motion and a second to adopt the minutes of March 17, 2016.

MOTION: Commissioner Zwissler moved approval of the Minutes, seconded by Commissioner Nelson.

VOTE: The motion carried with a vote of 15-0-1 with Commissioners Addiego, Bates, Gilmore, Gioia, Gorin, McGrath, Nelson, Pine, Randolph, McElhinney, Techel, Wagenknecht, Ziegler, Zwissler and Chair Wasserman voting, "YES", no "NO", votes and Vice Chair Halsted abstaining.

5. Report of the Chair. Chair Wasserman reported on the following:

- a. **New Alternate.** We welcome Federal D. Glover (not present) who has been appointed as Commissioner Gioia's alternate.
- b. **New Business.** Does any Commissioner have any new business they want to propose at the moment? (No comments were received).
- c. **Orville Magoon.** I am sad to report the passing of Orville Magoon. Orville was an amazing man. He was a coastal engineer who was passionate about our coast and helped found the discipline. Among other accomplishments, he was the driving force behind the International Coastal Zone Conferences, where he graciously poured wine from his Guenoc winery. Even after he retired he was active in the field and took a particular interest in sediment processes that support coastal environments. We shall adjourn today's meeting in his honor.

The political turmoil in the country has not quite driven climate change off the front pages. There are a couple of interesting things that I hope you have noted.

One is that in Florida, Cape Canaveral is under threat from rising tides. We will see if that spurs a greater level of federal concern and federal action.

There have been further reports from James Hanson regarding the melting of the Antarctic Ice Sheet proceeding much more quickly than people have projected.

Rising tides are upon us.

- d. **Next BCDC Meeting.** Our next meeting will be May 5th at the Ferry Building in San Francisco, where we expect to take up the following matters: We may have a closed session on the Army Corps' refusal to accept conditions of their Consistency Determination for their dredging program. We expect to have a staff briefing on the Suisun Marsh Local Protection Plan update. We may have a briefing on the status of the Resilience by Design Initiative.

- e. **Ex-Parte Communications.** That completes my report. Does anybody wish to put any ex-parte communications on the record at this meeting? (No comments were received). Chair Wasserman moved on to the Executive Director's Report given by Acting Executive Director, Steve Goldbeck.

6. Report of the Executive Director. Acting Executive Director Steve Goldbeck presented the report:

I am pleased to announce that we have hired Meichelle Liang as a Senior Accounting Officer in our Financial Services Unit. Ms. Liang has a BS in Accounting from California State University, Sacramento. Prior to joining us Meichelle was an Accounting Analyst with the State Controller's Office in the Unclaimed Property Division.

Unless I hear any objections, we plan to appoint Ms. Liang to this position. Ms. Liang will be working and learning alongside Sebastian Sandoval and tackling our emerging challenges with the Fi\$Cal Accounting Program, particularly given our lack of a Chief Budget Officer.

We are still in the process to fill the Chief Budget Officer position.

Larry had informed you that we were hiring Todd Hallenbeck to join our permit staff, but I can now do him one better by producing Todd, Todd please stand up. (Stood and was recognized).

I am pleased to inform you that all our staff has completed their Form 700's. Almost all of the Commission has completed them, all but one; there is one outstanding Form 700 left. Please bring it in wherever you are.

You will remember that we requested that the Corps allow the Office for Coastal Management in NOAA to mediate the dispute regarding the Corps' refusal to comply with four conditions of the Commission's Letter of Agreement for the Corps maintenance dredging activities in the Bay. The Corps has since declined that request for mediation. As Chair Wasserman just stated, we will schedule a closed session regarding this matter.

Lastly, you have several interesting articles in your package, but I would like to call out the article entitled—*SF Estuary Partnership, Mainstreaming Resilience*—as a great overview of the topic that is well worth taking a little time from your busy schedules to review.

With that I would be happy to answer any questions.

Chair Wasserman continued: Any questions for Steve? (No questions were voiced).

7. Consideration of Administrative Matters. Chair Wasserman announced: There are no administrative matters for us to consider.

8. Adjournment. Chair Wasserman announced: We will now adjourn our regular meeting in honor of Orville Magoon, and continue as a Commission committee where we will hold the third of our workshops to consider key actions that BCDC should take regarding rising sea level. I would now entertain a motion and second to adjourn our meeting in honor of Orville Magoon.

Upon motion by Commissioner McGrath, seconded by Commissioner Randolph, the Commission meeting was adjourned in honor of Orville Magoon at 1:36 p.m.